



POSTAL REGULATORY COMMISSION  
Washington, DC 20268-0001

Office of the Secretary

July 25, 2013

Julie L. Batts  
1890 S. 14<sup>th</sup> Street  
Fernandina Beach, FL 32034

Re: Appeal of the Postal Service's Determination to Close Downtown Fernandina Beach Station, Fernandina Beach, FL

Dear Ms. Batts:

The Postal Regulatory Commission received your appeal regarding the Postal Service's determination to close Downtown Fernandina Beach Station in Fernandina Beach, Florida. The appeal has been assigned Docket No. A2013-7 and includes the appeal of an additional Petitioner. The Commission's Notice and Order accepting your appeal is enclosed.

A copy of Commission Form 61 is also enclosed. You may complete Form 61 or file a brief to provide the Commission with arguments to support your appeal. See 39 C.F.R. § 3025.40. The deadline for submission of your arguments is August 21, 2013. Other deadlines are set out in the Notice and Order accepting your appeal.

If you have questions, do not hesitate to call the Public Representative named in the Notice and Order. The telephone numbers and e-mail addresses of Public Representatives are posted on the Commission's website, [www.prc.gov](http://www.prc.gov). You may also call the Commission's docket section (202-789-6847) to obtain contact information for the Public Representative assigned to your appeal. Please keep in mind that the Public Representative represents the interests of the general public and may not necessarily support all of your arguments.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read "Shoshana M. Grove".

Shoshana M. Grove  
Secretary

Enclosures

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA  
POSTAL REGULATORY COMMISSION  
WASHINGTON, DC 20268-0001

Before Commissioners:

Ruth Y. Goldway, Chairman;  
Robert G. Taub, Vice Chairman;  
Mark Acton;  
Tony Hammond; and  
Nanci E. Langley

Downtown Fernandina Beach Station  
Fernandina Beach, FL

Docket No. A2013-7

NOTICE AND ORDER ACCEPTING APPEAL AND  
ESTABLISHING PROCEDURAL SCHEDULE

(Issued July 24, 2013)

Notice is hereby given that, on July 22, 2013, the Commission posted two Petitions for Review (Petitions) of the Postal Service's closure of the Downtown Fernandina Beach Station in Fernandina Beach, Florida.<sup>1</sup> The Petitions were filed by Julie L. Batts and David A. Granger (Petitioners). The Granger Petition includes a request to suspend action on the final determination pending the outcome of this appeal. The Commission hereby institutes a proceeding under 39 U.S.C. § 404(d)(5)

---

<sup>1</sup> See Petition for Review and Request for Suspension Received from David A. Granger Regarding the Downtown Fernandina Beach Station Post Office, Fernandina Beach, FL 32034, July 22, 2013 (Granger Petition); Petition for Review Received from Julie L. Batts Regarding the Downtown Fernandina Beach Station Post Office, Fernandina Beach, FL 32034, July 22, 2013.

and establishes Docket No. A2013-7 to consider Petitioners' appeals and the request to suspend action on the Postal Service's final determination. Petitioners may further explain each individual's position with supplemental information or facts. Petitioners may file Participant Statements on PRC Form 61 or briefs with the Commission no later than August 21, 2013.

*Categories of issues apparently raised.* Petitioners contend that the Postal Service's decision to close the Downtown Fernandina Beach Station was: (1) arbitrary and capricious (see 39 U.S.C. § 404(d)(5)(A)); (2) without observance of procedures required by law (see 39 U.S.C. § 404(d)(5)(B)); and (3) unsupported by substantial evidence on the record (see 39 U.S.C. § 404(d)(5)(C)).

After the Postal Service files the Administrative Record and the Commission reviews it, the Commission may find that there are more legal issues than those set forth above, or that the Postal Service's determination disposes of one or more of those issues. The deadline for the Postal Service to file the applicable Administrative Record with the Commission is August 1, 2013. See 39 C.F.R. § 3025.21. In addition, the due date for any Postal Service pleading in response to this Notice is August 1, 2013.

*Application for Suspension of Determination.* The Granger Petition requests suspension of the Postal Service's final determination until the outcome of the appeal. See 39 C.F.R. § 3025.30. Commission rules allow for the Postal Service to file an answer to such application within 10 days after the application is filed. The Postal Service answer to the request is due no later than August 1, 2013.

*Availability; website posting.* The Commission has posted the appeals and supporting material on its website at <http://www.prc.gov>. Additional filings in this case and participants' submissions will also be posted on the website, if provided in electronic format or amenable to conversion, and not subject to a valid protective order. Information on how to use the Commission's website is available online or by contacting the Commission's webmaster via telephone at 202-789-6873 or via electronic mail at [prc-webmaster@prc.gov](mailto:prc-webmaster@prc.gov).

The appeals and all related documents are also available for public inspection in the Commission's docket section. Docket section hours are 8:00 a.m. to 4:30 p.m., Eastern Time, Monday through Friday, except on Federal government holidays. Docket section personnel may be contacted via electronic mail at *prc-dockets@prc.gov* or via telephone at 202-789-6846.

*Filing of documents.* All Postal Service filings in this case shall be made using the Internet (Filing Online) pursuant to Commission rules 9(a) and 10(a). See 39 C.F.R. §§ 3001.9(a) and 3001.10(a). Other participants may also use Filing Online. Instructions for obtaining an account to file documents online may be obtained on the Commission's website, <http://www.prc.gov>, or by contacting the Commission's docket section at *prc-dockets@prc.gov* or via telephone at 202-789-6846.

The Commission reserves the right to redact personal information that may infringe on an individual's privacy rights from documents filed in this proceeding.

*Participation by others.* Persons other than Petitioners and the Postal Service wishing to be heard in this matter may submit comments. See 39 C.F.R. § 3025.14. Initial comments supporting a remand of this case are to be filed on or before August 21, 2013. This and other deadlines are set out in the attached Procedural Schedule. See 39 C.F.R. §§ 3025.41 through 3025.43.

*Further procedures.* By statute, the Commission is required to issue its decision within 120 days from the date it receives the appeal. See 39 U.S.C. § 404(d)(5). A Procedural Schedule has been developed to accommodate this statutory deadline. In the interest of expedition, the Commission may request the Postal Service or other participants to submit information or memoranda of law on any appropriate issue. **If any motions are filed by the Postal Service, responses are due 10 days after any such motion is filed.** See 39 C.F.R. § 3025.2(c).

*It is ordered:*

1. The Postal Service answer to the request for suspension of the Postal Service's final determination is due no later than August 1, 2013.

2. The Postal Service shall file the applicable Administrative Record regarding this appeal no later than August 1, 2013.
3. Any responsive pleading by the Postal Service to this Notice is due no later than August 1, 2013.
4. The Procedural Schedule listed below is hereby adopted.
5. Pursuant to 39 U.S.C. § 505, Anne J. Siarnacki is designated an officer of the Commission (Public Representative) to represent the interests of the general public.

By the Commission.

Shoshana M. Grove  
Secretary

## PROCEDURAL SCHEDULE

July 22, 2013	Filing of Appeal
August 1, 2013	Deadline for the Postal Service to file answer responding to application for suspension (see 39 C.F.R. § 3025.30)
August 1, 2013	Deadline for the Postal Service to file the applicable Administrative Record in this appeal
August 1, 2013	Deadline for the Postal Service to file any responsive pleading
August 21, 2013	Deadline for Petitioner's Form 61 or initial brief in support of the petition (see 39 C.F.R. § 3025.41)
September 4, 2013	Deadline for answering brief in support of the Postal Service (see 39 C.F.R. § 3025.42)
September 16, 2013	Deadline for reply briefs in response to answering briefs (see 39 C.F.R. § 3025.43)
November 19, 2013	Expiration of the Commission's 120-day decisional schedule (see 39 U.S.C. § 404(d)(5))

**PLEASE READ THESE INSTRUCTIONS ENTIRELY  
BEFORE FILLING OUT THE ENCLOSED  
PARTICIPANT STATEMENT**

**APPEALS OF POSTAL SERVICE DETERMINATIONS  
TO CLOSE OR CONSOLIDATE POST OFFICES**

**INTRODUCTION**

Congress requires the Postal Service to follow specific procedures and to consider certain factors before making a Final Determination to close or consolidate a post office. When a patron appeals a Final Determination, the Postal Regulatory Commission (Commission) must decide whether the Postal Service's closure or consolidation of a post office is consistent with the law. **The Commission may not change the Postal Service's Final Determination.** It may only (1) affirm the determination, or (2) remand the entire matter to the Postal Service for further consideration.

You may assist the Commission in its consideration of your appeal by sending a written statement explaining why you believe that the Postal Service has not complied with the law. Enclosed please find a Participant Statement form, which you may use to present your written argument. The purpose of the Participant Statement is the same as a formal brief, which is to point out issues that you believe the Commission should consider in its review of the Postal Service's actions. You may also identify items in the Administrative Record that support your position. You are not required to use this form. You may file a Participant Statement as well as a formal brief.

**REASONS FOR REMANDING A FINAL DETERMINATION**

The Commission may remand a Final Determination if the Postal Service (1) fails to follow proper procedure, or (2) fails to provide a written record of its actions that is adequate to support its decision. The legal language that specifies how the Commission evaluates a Final Determination appears under the heading "Postal Regulatory Commission Authority" below. General examples of some reasons for remand would be:

1. The Postal Service did not follow the procedure required by law;
2. The Postal Service did not adequately consider certain issues it is required to consider;
3. The facts relied on by the Postal Service have not been established;
4. The facts in the Postal Service's Final Determination are true, but they do not prove what the Postal Service says they prove; or
5. The Final Determination does not resolve conflicts in the Administrative Record.

## REVIEWING THE ADMINISTRATIVE RECORD

When investigating a post office for possible closing or consolidation, the Postal Service keeps a record of all the actions it takes (such as soliciting comments or holding a community meeting) and all the facts it considers in reaching a decision on whether to close or consolidate the post office. This record is called the Administrative Record. The Administrative Record also contains the Proposal, the Final Determination, and other documents the Postal Service collects during its investigation. **You should review the Administrative Record before preparing your Participant Statement,** and you should provide references to it to support the arguments and assertions in your Participant Statement.

When considering appeals of Final Determinations to close or consolidate post offices, the Commission is limited to "appellate jurisdiction." As a result, the Commission cannot conduct its own fact-finding investigation and must consider appeals based solely upon the Administrative Record. **Postal Service regulations require that a copy of the Administrative Record be available at affected post offices** (*i.e.*, wherever the Final Determination is posted) for 30 days after the Final Determination is first posted. If an appeal is filed, the Administrative Record remains available at the affected post offices, and **all documents filed with the Commission relating to the appeal will be posted at the affected post offices.** Affected post offices include the post office to be closed or consolidated, the proposed supervising post office, and any post office likely to serve a significant number of customers of the post office to be closed or consolidated.

## AUTHORITY OF THE POSTAL SERVICE

In keeping with its responsibility to operate the nation's mail system, the Postal Service has been given considerable authority over the operations of post offices. This authority includes the power to decide whether a post office should be closed or consolidated. However, before reaching a decision to close or consolidate a post office, the Postal Service must follow a procedure set up by law, and it must take account of certain specific effects of such an action.

## PROCEDURE

The law sets out steps the Postal Service must take before it closes or consolidates a post office. Prior to making a determination as to the necessity of closing or consolidating any post office, the Postal Service must provide adequate notice of its intention to close or consolidate the post office. Notice must be given at least 60 days prior to the proposed date of closing or consolidation to persons served by the post office. This is to insure that such persons have an opportunity to present their views. The Postal Service calls the "notice of its intention to close or consolidate" the "Proposal." During the 60 days, patrons are invited to give the Postal Service their comments on the proposed closing or consolidation.



The Postal Service calls its decision to close or consolidate a post office the "Final Determination." Any Final Determination of the Postal Service to close or consolidate a post office must be in writing and must include the findings of the Postal Service with respect to certain specific factors. The Final Determination and findings must be made available to persons served by the post office. The Postal Service may not close or consolidate a post office until 60 days after its written Final Determination is made available to persons served by the post office.

#### FACTORS TO BE CONSIDERED

In addition to following the required procedure, the Postal Service must also consider certain factors. The Postal Service must consider:

- (A) the effect of the closing or consolidation on the community served by that post office;
- (B) the effect of the closing or consolidation on employees of the Postal Service employed at that office;
- (C) whether the closing or consolidation is consistent with the policy of the Government that the Postal Service shall provide a maximum degree of effective and regular postal services to rural areas, communities, and small towns where post offices are not self-sustaining;
- (D) the economic savings to the Postal Service resulting from the closing or consolidation; and
- (E) such other factors as the Postal Service determines are necessary.

#### POSTAL REGULATORY COMMISSION AUTHORITY

Limitations on the Commission's authority prohibit it from remanding a Final Determination to the Postal Service simply because the Commission believes a different result might be better. Rather, the Commission may only examine the Postal Service's decision and record in order to determine whether the Postal Service abided by statutory guidelines. Specifically, the law requires that the Commission affirm the Postal Service's Final Determination unless the determination is:

- (A) arbitrary, capricious, an abuse of discretion, or otherwise not in accordance with the law;
- (B) without observance of procedure required by law; or
- (C) unsupported by substantial evidence on the record.

## PARTICIPANT STATEMENT

We have included a form that you may use for your written argument.

### **The Participant Statement should be as specific as possible.**

Commission proceedings to review Postal Service Final Determinations to close or consolidate post offices can be much less formal than is customary in courts. The Commission does not require patrons appealing Postal Service decisions to meet the usual format requirements for filed documents. However, it is important that papers sent to the Postal Regulatory Commission be legible. It is also important for statements to be clear and as specific as possible.

The due date for a Participant Statement or brief can be found in the schedule which is attached as an Appendix to the "Notice and Order of Filing of Appeal." You should have a copy of the Notice and Order. If you do not, you should be able to find a copy posted at the post office.

Briefs and Participant Statements may be filed electronically, using the Filing Online function on the Commission's website, [www.prc.gov](http://www.prc.gov), or by mail. Under its rules, the Commission expects to receive briefs on or before the day specified in the schedule, rather than receiving briefs that are simply postmarked by that day.

### **Address the Participant Statement or brief to:**

Office of the Secretary  
Postal Regulatory Commission  
901 New York Avenue, NW, Suite 200  
Washington, DC 20268

BEFORE THE  
POSTAL REGULATORY COMMISSION  
WASHINGTON, DC 20268

In the Matter of

Docket No.: \_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_  
Post Office                      State                      ZIP Code

\_\_\_\_\_Petitioner(s)

PARTICIPANT STATEMENT

1.        Petitioner(s) are appealing the Postal Service's Final Determination concerning the \_\_\_\_\_ post office. The Final Determination was posted \_\_\_\_\_  
(date)

2.        In accordance with applicable law, 39 U.S.C. § 404(d)(5), the Petitioner(s) request the Postal Regulatory Commission to review the Postal Service's Final Determination on the basis of the Administrative Record before the Postal Service in the making of the Final Determination.

3.        Petitioners: Please set out below the reasons why you believe the Postal Service's Final Determination should be reversed and returned to the Postal Service for further consideration. (See pages 1 and 3 of the Instructions for an outline of the kinds of reasons the law requires us to consider.) Please be as specific as possible. Please continue on additional paper if you need more space and attach the additional page(s) to this form.

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

## This image shows a single sheet of white paper with horizontal ruling lines. The lines are evenly spaced and run across the width of the page. There are no margins, text, or other markings on the paper.